

## Session 6: Defensive Coordination: Normative Basis for Public-Private Partnerships (Friday, 9:00 – 10:30 AM)

**Roundtable:** Melissa Hathaway (co-moderator), Greg Rattray (co-moderator), Andrew Cushman, Rex Hughes, Michael Sechrist

1. What are exemplar Private-Public-Partnerships? What makes them successful or models for others to follow?
2. How do we achieve better global learning about what does and does not work related to defensive collaboration and understand the requirements (if any) for a global level operational coordination for specified activities (ala the World Health Organization)?
3. There are dozens of PPP in the United States and 100s world-wide; how do we consolidate these PPPs? What are some of the impediments to the PPP (e.g., regulation, law, policy)?
4. How can governments empower these actors with legitimacy for appropriate actions (such as activities to identify and eradicate botnets) as well as better coordinate public-private operational response (beyond information sharing)?
5. Who should have the lead in a Private-Public Partnership? How do we incentivize/encourage participation?
6. How do we include the range of private sector and NGO players active in cyber defense in the norms setting effort?

A slide from the recent European Network and Information Security Agency report on Public Private Partnerships can help facilitate further questions:

Why	Who	How	What	When
<b>Scope</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Deter</li> <li>• Protect</li> <li>• Detect</li> <li>• Respond</li> <li>• Recover</li> </ul> <b>Threat</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All Hazards</li> <li>• Natural Hazards</li> <li>• System Failure</li> <li>• Cyber-crime</li> <li>• Terrorism</li> </ul>	<b>Coverage</b> <p><b>Geographical</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• National</li> <li>• European</li> <li>• International</li> <li>• Protect</li> </ul> <p><b>Focus</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Geographical</li> <li>• Sector</li> <li>• Cross Sector</li> <li>• Thematic</li> </ul> <p><b>Links</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Across National boundaries</li> <li>• Within national boundary</li> <li>• CERTS or CSIRTS</li> <li>• Regulator</li> <li>• Government Bodies</li> <li>• Law Enforcement Bodies</li> </ul>	<b>Governance</b> <p><b>Activity type</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Long term community</li> <li>• Working group</li> <li>• Rapid response</li> <li>• Combined activity</li> <li>• Overarching strategy or advisory group</li> </ul> <p><b>Leadership</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Run by one from within</li> <li>• Run by a coordinating entity</li> <li>• Democratically Peer led</li> </ul> <p><b>Funding</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mandatory Membership</li> <li>• Charging for value</li> <li>• Public pays all or some</li> <li>• Members own time and travel</li> </ul> <p><b>Communication Style</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Face-to-face</li> <li>• Virtual but personal</li> <li>• Computer based distribution</li> <li>• Computer based collaboration</li> </ul> <p><b>Rules</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formal membership rules</li> <li>• Formal information usage agreements</li> <li>• Trust building policies</li> <li>• Membership requires security clearance</li> </ul>	<b>Services</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Research/Analysis</li> <li>• Good practice guides</li> <li>• Early warnings</li> <li>• Exercises</li> <li>• Awareness raising</li> <li>• Etc.</li> </ul> <b>Incentives</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reduced exposure</li> <li>• Cost Savings</li> <li>• Access to valuable knowledge</li> <li>• Influence regulation or national policies</li> <li>• Etc.</li> </ul>	<b>Start up/ Sustainability</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Top down</li> <li>• Bottom up</li> <li>• Top down then grown bottom up</li> <li>• Bottom up then grown top down</li> <li>• Fire and forget</li> <li>• Split or merge</li> </ul>